

**The Head, the Heart, and the Hands: Hampton, Carlisle, and Hilo
in/as Circuits of Transpacific Empire, 1819-1887**

by

Veronica A. Pasfield

**A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
Of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
(American Culture)
in the University of Michigan
2013**

Doctoral Committee:

Associate Professor Michael Witgen, Chair

Professor Tiya Miles

Associate Professor Vicente Diaz, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Associate Professor Susan Najita

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation is dedicated to my son, Tyler Daniel Barron, and all indigenous youth past and present. The ancestors, your communities, and your children are counting on you to maintain the failure of Indian boarding schools. Do the best you can with what you've got. Use your medicines when you need them. Keep the dialogue going with Creator. As Odawa elder Roland Petoskey instructed me, "Culture is what you do with your children every day." You are the product of the love and struggles of generations.

Chi-miigwetch to my advisor, Professor Michael Witgen, for his encouragement and advocacy during my graduate work. His in-depth engagement with my chapter drafts elevated this work immeasurably. His scholarship, particularly the ways he illuminates the agency and ingenuity of Indian peoples, deeply inspired me. Miigwetch miinwaa/Thanks also to my committee: Professors Tiya Miles, Vince Diaz, and Susan Najita. Tiya's patient and deeply considered input taught me much about the strengths and shortcomings of my claims. Her brilliant rendering of people marginalized by history served as a guiding star. The stunning promise of deeply engaged interdisciplinarity between Native American and Pacific Island Studies was sometimes the only thing that kept me going. Heartfelt thanks to Vince for helping me navigate a route, and encouraging me always to keep paddling.

Thanks also to Susan, whose whole-hearted reception of my efforts bolstered me as much as her thoughtful critique.

Heartfelt thanks go out to others in the Department of American Culture. Professor Greg Dowd served as an early and steadfast source of encouragement and advice to me and others in the small (but fierce) Native graduate student community. Professor Phil Deloria offered the first encouragement to apply to the program, and I thank him for teaching me so much about navigating the historiographical, theoretical, and academic landscapes. Professors Kristin Hass and Julie Ellison also offered early and sustained encouragement to continue my graduate studies, and their commitment to public history made me believe there was a place for me in this work. The scholarship and encouragement of other faculty further nurtured my curiosity and dedication: Professors Gavin Clarkson, Bob Frost, Sarita See, Amy Stillman, Maria Cotera, and Nadine Naber. Last, but by no means least, I offer major thanks to the incredible departmental staff in American Culture, especially Marlene Moore. Marlene, Judy Gray, Tabitha Rohn, and Mary Freiman unfailingly created a welcoming and supportive home base, for which I am exceedingly grateful.

This dissertation owes a deep debt to the funding sources that made it possible. The University of Michigan American Indian Grant (formerly the Tuition Waiver) honored federal treaty and state obligations to American Indian student funding. Rackham Graduate School at the University of Michigan generously provided several key sources of funding, including a Rackham Graduate Student

Research Grant that facilitated two key archival trips. Major thanks to the Dissertation Writing Institute at the University of Michigan's Gayle Morris Sweetland Center for Writing, which funded and facilitated deeply valuable development of two chapters. The input of the institute cohort and writing advisor Paul Barron helped immeasurably. An Arts of Citizenship grant from the University of Michigan helped me work with Professor Vince Diaz to develop connections between Anishinaabe and Pacific Island canoe traditions, A National Science Foundation grant funded summer teaching and research on Bay Mills Indian Community, deepening my understanding of the treaty and political pressures leading into the boarding school era in Michigan. The Department in American Culture and Rackham Graduate School also offered generous internal funding sources.

This project would have been impossible without the amazing resources of many archives, and the dedicated professionals who maintain them. Sincerest gratitude to: Amistad Research Center at Tulane University, and archivist Christopher Harter; Bay Mills Indian Community History Department, and historians Paula Carrick and Wanda Perron; Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library at Yale University, and curator George Miles; Clarke Historical Library at Central Michigan University, and archivist John Fierst; Cumberland County Historical Society, and Barbara Landis; Hampton University Archives, and archivist Donzella Maupin and Andreesse Scott; Library of Congress; National Archives and Records Administration-Great Lakes Regional Branch, and archivist Scott Forsythe

and colleagues; Oklahoma Historical Society, and curator Bill Welge; St. Augustine Historical Society; Smithsonian Institution Archives; Williams College Archives & Special Collections, and archivist Sylvia Kennick Brown; Ziibiwing Research Center, and archivist Anita Heard.

I had the exceptional good fortune of being a part of a fierce cohort of indigenous graduate students, possibly the largest in the history of the University of Michigan. Our efforts to help decolonize our university will remain among the most gratifying experiences of my life; now more than 1,500 ancestors are on their way back to peaceful graves, and schoolchildren will be spared the weird spectacle of the Indian dioramas. The passion, patience, and love of my friends in Native Caucus sustained and uplifted me. I have deep faith in the contributions they are making, and will continue to make. From the bottom of my heart, *chi-miigwetch*/big thanks especially to Kelly Fayard, Chris Finley, Paul D. Irwin, John Low, Angela Parker, Kiri Sailiata, Conner Sandefur, Brittany Marino Sandefur, and Lani Teves. I'm quite certain I would not have made it through without your intellectual prowess, potlucking wizardry, and willingness to share a cup of tea with me when the going got rough.

From this pool of fabulousness emerged two friends I now consider sisters: Professors Angela Parker and Kelly Fayard. I found constant inspiration in Angela's formidable analytic gifts and savvy deployment of indigenous and academic resources in the service of Native-centered scholarship. Her unrelenting standards for herself and American Indian History raised my bar, and the university's. Kelly

Fayard accomplished what at first seemed impossible to me; she retained her heart and her ethics in often-difficult circumstances. Kelly held down the front lines in Anthropology armed not with a deadly bolt, but with a deep love for her people, her peeps, her field, and the ancestors. The heart she shows in her writing and her teaching inspires me constantly. Fort Bethold and Poarch Creek should be proud. I owe you much.

I also was blessed with the inspiring efforts and collaboration of other groups on campus, especially the Native American Students Association leaders and guiding elders: Alys Alley, Art Brant, Alyx Cadotte, Forrest Cox, Nickole Fox, Andrea Pierce, Michelle Saboo, all our veterans and other powwow volunteers. You accomplished so much with so few resources. Major thanks also to my American Culture cohort, citizens of Panini Nation, and amazing fellow graduate students, particularly Rabia Belt, Brian Chung, Heijin Lee, Dean Saranillio, Matt Stiffler, and Kiara Vigil.

I cannot (and should not) separate my research and writing about the creation of the federal Indian boarding school system from advocacy related to University of Michigan campus museums. American museums and boarding schools came of age simultaneously, often under the leadership of overlapping and interlinked personnel and agendas. Engaging with diverse allies to change the university's Indian dioramas and curation of Native American human remains and funerary objects served as a practicum for what I was learning in Native American Studies. The following people taught me that positive change is possible: cousins and THPO Officers Paula Carrick and Wanda Perron, of the Bay Mills History

Department; Cultural Preservationists Wes and Elli Andrews; Vice President for Research Stephen Forrest; Professor Bob Frost; Little Traverse Bay Band warrior Fred Harrington; Exhibit Museum of Natural History Director Amy Harris; the Ziibiwing Center's William Johnson and Shannon Martin; Dr. David Michener; the National NAGPRA Program's David Tarler and Sherry Hutt; NAGPRA Project Manager Ben Secunda; Museum Studies Program Director Ray Silverman; participants of the Michigan Anishinaabe Cultural Preservation and Repatriation Alliance; Native American Studies faculty; the Advisory Committee on Culturally Unidentifiable Human Remains; and the Ethnography as Activism graduate student work group. Chi-miigwetch/Thank-you so very much!

It takes a village for a single mother to make her way through graduate school. First and foremost, I must give thanks for the considerable patience of my son, Tyler Daniel Barron. My decision to enter graduate school impacted his life profoundly. He tolerated the challenges caused by Mom's graduate training with great humor and understanding. From second grade until now, he showed me he took to heart the conversations and issues swirling around him. He was my inspiration. Major thanks also to the support of my family, who helped me financially, spiritually, emotionally, and soulfully: my parents, Mary Jean and Joe St. Dennis; Kathy and Mark Kujawski; Margaret Hutchinson; Philip, Tammy, Estelle, and Lois Hutchinson; the rest of the Hutchinson clan; Rob, Nancy, and Elliot Hoffman, particularly research assistant extraordinaire Nancy Bookman Hoffman; Wanda Perron and Paula Carrick, and their inspiring work in the Bay Mills History

Department; the administrators, culture-keepers, fishermen and leadership of my tribe, Bay Mills Indian Community; and the language program at Bay Mills Community College.

My chosen family of friends supported me every step of the way, with loving words of encouragement, amazing meals, and fun excursions that restored mind, body and soul. Special love and thanks to: Kelle Rodrigues and family; Margo Noss and family; Fred and Julie Harrington and family; Victor and Trish Kishego and family; Tony Davis; Dr. Ben Ramirez; Sandy Finkel and family; Jennifer Knapp and family; David Michener and Wil Strickland; Trey McNeill; and the American Indian Health and Family Services community.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ii
List of Figures	x
Abstract	xii
Introduction: The Head, the Heart, and the Hands: Hampton, Carlisle, and Hilo Industrial Schools in/as Circuits of Transpacific Empire, 1819-1887	1
Chapter One: Sleeping in Her Moccasins: Indian Boarding School Creation Story in Captivity, and Total War on the Southern Plains, 1864-1875	18
Chapter Two: Eating the Hearts of Enemies: Mochis, Harriet Beecher Stowe, Richard Pratt & Encounter in Florida, 1875-1878	96
Chapter Three: Re-Membering Mo'olelo: 'Opukaha'ia, the Armstrongs, and Education in Trans-Pacific Empire and Hawaiian Dispossession	164
Chapter Four: The "Ploughshare & pruning-hook period will be inaugurated very shortly": Captivity Gives Way to Dispossession	222
Conclusion: "I ready go guard house. I stay there thousand years, never shake hands wid him": Captivity as a Practice of Obedience, Obfuscation, and Resistance	260
Bibliography	280

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1—*Get thee behind me, (Mrs.) Satan! I'd rather travel the hardest path of matrimony than follow your footsteps.* From Nast, Thomas. “Get Thee Behind Me, Mrs. Satan!” *Harper's Weekly*, v. 16, (1872 February 17): 140. 118

Figure 2—*Medicine Water and Mochis at Fort Marion, from “Tears in the Sand” on Rocky Mountain PBS.* 129

Photographer: O. Pierre Haven.

Title: “Southern Gems.”

By: The Florida Club

Robert Dennis Collection of Stereoscopic Views, New York Public Library

CALL NO: MFY Dennis Coll 90-F139

Figure 3—*Mochis is in the back row, far left.* 139

Photographer: O. Pierre Haven.

Title: “Southern Gems.”

By: The Florida Club

Robert Dennis Collection of Stereoscopic Views, New York Public Library

CALL NO: MFY Dennis Coll 90-F139

Figure 4—“Captain Pratt Visiting Class at Fort Marion” by Zotom, a Kiowa POW at Fort Marion. Taylor Museum at the Colorado Springs Fine Arts Center.
<<https://plainsledgerart.org/plates/view/402>> 149

Figure 5—“Classroom at Fort Marion” by Howling Wolf, a Cheyenne POW, 1876. New York State Library, Albany. 150

Figure 6—*Mochis is in the back row, third from right.*

158

Photographer: O. Pierre Haven.

Title: "Southern Gems."

By: The Florida Club

Robert Dennis Collection of Stereoscopic Views, New York Public Library

CALL NO: MFY Dennis Coll 90-F139

Figure 7—*Where did Mochis go?*

159

Photographer: O. Pierre Haven.

Title: "Southern Gems."

By: The Florida Club

Robert Dennis Collection of Stereoscopic Views, New York Public Library

CALL NO: MFY Dennis Coll 90-F139

Figure 8— "Portrait of Elva Medicine Water 1879," by John Choate. From the National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution. LOCAL NUMBER: NAA INV 06817000, Photo Lot 81-12 06817000. National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution. <<http://collections.si.edu/search/results.htm?q=Elva+medicine+water&image.x=0&image.y=0>>

275

Figure 9—"Medicine Water? or Soft Belly?" by James Moody. From the National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution. LOCAL NUMBER: NAA INV 00366000, Photo Lot 81-12 06817000.

<<http://collections.si.edu/search/results.htm?q=medicine+water&image.x=0&image.y=0>>

276

Figure 10—"Medicine Water? or Soft Belly?" (in profile) by James Moody. From the National Anthropological Archives, Smithsonian Institution. LOCAL NUMBER: NAA INV 00366100, Photo Lot 81-12 06817000.

<<http://collections.si.edu/search/results.htm?q=medicine+water&image.x=0&image.y=0>>

277

ABSTRACT

***The Head, the Heart, and the Hands:
Hampton, Carlisle, and Hilo Industrial Schools
in/as Circuits of Transpacific Empire, 1819-1887***

The topic of federal American Indian Industrial boarding schools has inspired one of the most abundant historiographies in American Indian History. Yet, as my dissertation demonstrates, a wide and critical gap exists in the framing and historicization of this profoundly influential chapter of indigenous history, federal policy, and U.S. settler-colonialism. The established narrative of Indian industrial boarding schools situates their origin at an abandoned Army barracks in Carlisle, Pennsylvania in 1879. This dissertation, "The Head, the Heart, and the Hands: Hampton, Carlisle, and Hilo Industrial Schools in/as Circuits of Transpacific Empire, 1819-1887" establishes new spatial, temporal, and political boundaries for the creation of the U.S. federal Indian boarding school system.

This dissertation disrupts disciplinary bounding and locates Indian boarding schools in particularly charged intersections of Pacific Island and American Indian histories. Understanding them as such creates space for scholarship that interrogates American Indian boarding schools with a broader, more accurate, and more forceful critique. This work aims to make a critical intervention in the theorizing of the federal Indian boarding school system, one that substantively elucidates the impact of Native

peoples upon one another and the federal policy makers who would profoundly shape the lives of generations of Indian families. This dissertation also aims to illuminate ways in which federal Indian education facilitated indigenous dispossession and U.S. settler-colonialism.

Further, I hope my work honors the experiences of my family members, who attended Michigan's Mt. Pleasant Indian Industrial School and went on to contribute much beauty, wisdom and love in our home communities—Bay Mills Indian Community and Walpole Island First Nation. Tribal oral histories about boarding schools, as well as the legacy of silence, inspired and motivated my work.